A Tale of Two Cities: Minority Matriculates in the Margins

Kenyon Railey, MD
Peggy Robinson, MS, MHS, PA-C
Duke University Physician Assistant Program
2013 PAEA Forum Focused Discussion
Thursday, October 17, 2013
Session Objectives

- At the conclusion of this session, attendees will:
  - Understand the revised definition of underrepresented minority as outlined by the Association of American Medical Colleges.
  - Review demographic data on minority students in graduate medical education, highlighting trends within Physician Assistant (PA) education.
  - Identify and examine perceptions and stressors unique to underrepresented minority students.
  - Increase vigilance and early recognition of potentially marginalized groups in order to enhance the well being and outcomes of at risk students.
  - Identify and explore potential interventions that can lead to improved academic success and outcomes for minorities within PA education.
Two students. . .

Amber is a 24 year old White female with a BS in Microbiology from Stead University, a small liberal arts college in North Carolina. Her undergraduate GPA was 3.3, with an undergraduate science GPA of 3.4. Her verbal reasoning GRE score was 152 (490) with an quantitative score of 159 (590). Prior to applying to PA school, she had 3,350 hours of patient contact experience and 3,000 hours of community service.

Erica is a 24 year old African-American female with a BS in Microbiology from Stead University, a small liberal arts college in North Carolina. Her undergraduate GPA was 3.3, with an undergraduate science GPA of 3.4. Her verbal reasoning GRE score was 152 (490) with an quantitative score of 144 (520). Prior to applying to PA school, she had 3,350 hours of patient contact experience and 3,000 hours of community service.
The Questions

• Who are the students that are considered “in the margins” of PA education?

• Do minority students have a different educational experience in PA school?
  o If so, why is the experience different?

• When should faculty consider the potentially unique needs of minority students?
  • What interventions are currently being used to address these needs?

• Why is this important?
What is a URM?

- Prior to 2003, the AAMC's definition of "underrepresented minority" (or "URM") included only African-Americans, Mexican-Americans, Native Americans, and mainland Puerto Ricans.
- In June 2003, the AAMC Executive Council adopted this revision:
  - "Underrepresented in medicine' means those racial and ethnic populations that are underrepresented in the medical profession relative to their numbers in the general population."
United States (US) Vital Statistics

- 2010 US Population: ~309 million
- White-Americans: ~223 million (72 %)
- Hispanic-Americans: ~50.5 million (16 %)
- African-Americans: ~39 million (13 %)
- Asian-Americans: ~15 million (5 %)
- Native-Americans: ~2.9 million (0.9 %)
- Estimates suggest that by 2023, the percentage of white, non-Hispanic (NH) children will drop below 50%.

Source: 2010 Census
Diversity in Medical Education – PA Programs

Figure 16. PA Program First-Year Enrollment by Ethnicity (White/Non-White), 1984–2011
Table 21. Race and Ethnicity of Matriculating Students from CASPA Programs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Number of Matriculants</th>
<th>% of Matriculants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>3,749</td>
<td>75.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black or African-American</td>
<td>166</td>
<td>3.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>946</td>
<td>19.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Native Hawaiian or Pacific Islander</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Indian or Alaskan Native</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>1.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>4,941</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethnicity</th>
<th>Number of Matriculants</th>
<th>% of Matriculants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic</td>
<td>606</td>
<td>13.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Hispanic</td>
<td>4,058</td>
<td>87.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>4,664</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Diversity in Medical Education – MD Programs

Figure 12: Percentage of U.S. Medical School Matriculants by Race and Ethnicity, 2010–2011

- American Indian or Alaska Native: 0.3% (2010), 0.2% (2011)
- Asian: 20.4% (2010), 20.1% (2011)
- Black or African American: 6.3% (2010), 6.1% (2011)
- Hispanic or Latino: 8.2% (2010), 8.5% (2011)
- Native Hawaiian and Other Pacific Islander: 0.1% (2010), 0.1% (2011)
- White: 57.1% (2010), 57.5% (2011)
- More than One Non-Hispanic or Latino Race: 2.8% (2010), 3.0% (2011)
- Other Non-Hispanic or Latino Race: 0.02% (2010), 0.02% (2011)
- No Race Response: 3.3% (2010), 3.2% (2011)
- Foreign: 1.5% (2010), 1.2% (2011)

Note: Those that reported more than one race are included under Non-Hispanic or More than one Latino Race.

Source: AAMC Data Warehouse: Applicant Matriculant File, as of 1/26/2012.

https://members.aamc.org/eweb/upload/Diversity\%20in\%20Medical\%20Education_Facts\%20and\%20Figures\%202012.pdf

PAEA 2013 Annual Education Forum
A Tale of Two Cities: Minority Matriculates in the Margins
Diversity in Medical Education - Faculty

Figure 18: Percentage and Number of U.S. Medical School Faculty by Race and Ethnicity, 2011

Table 10. Demographic Characteristics of PA Program Employees: Race and Ethnicity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race</th>
<th>FACULTY</th>
<th></th>
<th>STAFF</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>961</td>
<td>72.2%</td>
<td>315</td>
<td>69.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black or African-American</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>4.6%</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>11.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>3.5%</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>3.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Indian or Alaskan Native</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0.7%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missing/Blank</td>
<td>241</td>
<td>18.1%</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>14.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>1,331</td>
<td>450</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethnicity</th>
<th>FACULTY</th>
<th></th>
<th>STAFF</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic/Latino</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>4.7%</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>8.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Hispanic</td>
<td>860</td>
<td>64.6%</td>
<td>309</td>
<td>67.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blank</td>
<td>409</td>
<td>30.7%</td>
<td>108</td>
<td>23.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>1,331</td>
<td>455</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Faculty and staff with Pacific Island race and Other less than 5 were not represented.

https://members.aamc.org/eweb/upload/Diversity%20in%20Medical%20Education_Facts%20and%20Figures%202012.pdf
Session Outline

Please elect one individual to serve as scribe and another to serve as your group representative. Your task will be to address the following questions in the allotted time frame. There will be facilitators from session faculty available at each table.

✓ What are the common problems/issues facing the average PA student during training? (~5 minutes)

✓ Considering the previously generated list, identify issues that underrepresented minority students face that could potentially be different or accentuated? (~10 minutes)

✓ How do these issues present themselves in PA training? Furthermore, what are some early warning signs for students at risk? (~5 minutes)

✓ What interventions are currently being used? What interventions are needed? (~5 minutes)
Group Debrief
Unique URM Challenges Review

- Social isolation
- Trouble establishing peer support network
- Difficulty finding same ethnicity role models and mentors
- Lack of shadowing experiences prior to and during PA education
- Perception of needing to perform better in order to be treated equal
- Perception of being the representative for entire ethnic group
- Devaluation of racial and ethnic factors in “post racial” America
- Lack of financial resources
- Lack of educational support prior to matriculation
- Discrimination
- Others determined by group discussion
Take Home Points

• Underrepresented in medicine means “those racial and ethnic populations that are underrepresented in the medical profession relative to their numbers in the general population.“
• URM students may have different educational experiences than their non-URM counterparts.
• Once URM students matriculate to your program, faculty and staff must work to retain these students by:
  o Remaining mindful of potential differences in perspective among minority students and faculty
    • Valuing that perspective
  o Recognizing early warning signs of students at risk for attrition.
  o Intentionally increasing support systems by diversifying student body, faculty, and staff.
  o Consider novel interventional approaches for retention of URM students:
    • E.g. tutoring, counseling, mentoring, and or creation of pre-matriculation programs
    • Community networking
References

• Bowlin SD, Gugelchuk GM. The use of retention strategies in physician assistant programs to retain and graduate minority students. Perspective on Physician Assistant Education. 2000;11:7-11.


• Simmons SW. Predictors of academic success for underrepresented minorities in physician assistant programs. Perspective on Physician Assistant Education. 2003;14:110-113.